



DOI: 10.54919/physics/55.2024.223a13

Interaction of the CIS internal affairs bodies in the prevention of terrorism

Ganibek Otarbayev

Korkyt Ata Kyzylorda University
120014, 29A Aiteke bi Str., Kyzylorda, Republic of Kazakhstan

Lyazzat Karzhaubayeva*

Korkyt Ata Kyzylorda University
120014, 29A Aiteke bi Str., Kyzylorda, Republic of Kazakhstan

Yelena Milova

Korkyt Ata Kyzylorda University
120014, 29A Aiteke bi Str., Kyzylorda, Republic of Kazakhstan

Laura Otarbayeva

Police Department of the Astana City
010000, 19 Beibitshilik Str., Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan

Zhuldyzay Otarbayeva

Department of Education of Kyzylorda Region
120002, 1 Sultan Beybars Str., Kyzylorda, Republic of Kazakhstan

Abstract

Relevance. Terrorism poses a serious threat to the security and stability not only of individual states but also of the entire international community since by 2023 it has acquired a transnational character and is a threat not only to the internal security of the country but also to the external one. It is necessary to cooperate with the CIS internal affairs bodies and develop effective methods of preventing terrorist acts to combat terrorism.

Purpose. The purpose of this study was to examine the interaction of the CIS internal affairs bodies in the prevention of terrorism and identify effective methods of combating the terrorist threat.

Methodology. The following methods were used in the course of the study: analytical, synthesis, statistical.

Results. The analysis of normative legal acts and international treaties was also conducted and a comparison of ways to combat terrorism in the CIS member states was conducted. The study showed that the effectiveness of the fight against terrorism in the CIS depends on the quality of interaction between internal affairs bodies and their technical equipment and professional training. In addition, the study showed that the interaction of law enforcement agencies of different countries is more effective than the fight against crime factors within a single state.

Conclusions. An international united struggle can block the supply routes and financial support for terrorism. Thus, the study indicates the similarity of international legal acts and CIS legislation and their imperfection, which allows committing terrorist acts.

Keywords: fighting crime; anti-terrorist legislation; complicity; criminal liability; law enforcement agencies; international politics.

Suggested Citation:

Otarbayev G, Karzhaubayeva L, Milova Y, Otarbayeva L, Otarbayeva Z. Interaction of the CIS internal affairs bodies in the prevention of terrorism. *Sci Herald Uzhhorod Univ Ser Phys.* 2024;(55):2233-2243. DOI: 10.54919/physics/55.2024.223a13

*Corresponding author



Copyright © The Author(s). This is an open access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License 4.0 (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>)

Introduction

The problem of terrorism is one of the main threats to security in the world and interaction between the internal affairs bodies of the Commonwealth of Independent States (CIS) is necessary for the effective prevention of terrorist acts. In this regard, it is relevant to examine the interaction of the CIS internal affairs bodies in the fight against terrorism. Terrorism in the world is transnational in nature, endangering the world order, violating human rights and freedoms, and negatively affecting international cooperation. According to an investigation by the Institute of Economics and Peace, the number of victims as a result of terrorist acts is steadily decreasing, but a new feature is emerging – their accuracy and lethality [1].

Therefore, it is important to analyse the current threats of terrorism in the CIS member states and assess the effectiveness of measures taken by the CIS internal affairs bodies in combating them, based on the control of crime indicators exclusively in the CIS countries. This makes it clear that terrorism has been growing rapidly in the last decade, so the focus of the study has shifted to domestic terrorism and its causes. The issue of terrorism has been relevant before. Researchers L. Kuznar and J. Day [2] used statistical modelling of terrorism and named the main, in their opinion, crime factors, among which: corruption, war, state terrorism, fragile democracy, and unemployment are the main driving forces of terrorism in the region. Taken together, these results indicate that certain factors can influence local terrorism, but such consequences can be avoided. And this hypothesis coincides with the opinion of other researchers dealing with this issue. D. Hou [3] added only the type of regime, ethnic, linguistic, and religious components to the above. The author also believes that in recent decades Asia has become the core of terrorism. However, researchers did not consider that these factors can occur suddenly and require constant monitoring and careful planning in case of unforeseen circumstances.

In addition, although terrorists often act through third parties, researchers R. Bossong and L. Holmes [4] separate the meanings of organised crime and terrorism. The reason for everything is the financial component. According to them, terrorists have political motives and criminal groups pursue financial gain. However, a number of researchers believe that without monetisation, terrorism would not have such a scale. Therefore, one of the main tasks is to find and eliminate ways of financing terrorism [5; 6; 7]. A point-based approach to the outcomes of terrorism is useful, but it is partially valid in practice since it lacks an idea of the full scale of terrorism. There is a need for an integrated approach to methods of combating terrorism. Researchers R. Gunaratna [8] and H. Shin et al. [9] believe that reintegration and social engagement are essential weapons in the fight against terrorism and extremism. Since terrorism and extremism pose a serious threat to national security, it is extremely important that the governments of the countries restore stability and security by developing programmes for the rehabilitation of prisoners and the integration of radical individuals into society. If the government does not work with partners to rehabilitate terrorists and extremists, they will continue to pose a security threat and spread their ideology. However, closing the issue of preventing terrorism requires constant

crime monitoring and enhanced control of law enforcement agencies and the Commonwealth of States.

Based on the above, the purpose of the study is to identify measures, mechanisms, and strategies for the interaction of the CIS internal affairs bodies in the fight against terrorism, assess their effectiveness, and develop recommendations for improving cooperation between law enforcement and special services to prevent terrorist acts, protect state security, and ensure stability in the region. The goal assumes the following tasks:

1. Analysis of modern threats of terrorism in the CIS member states and assessment of the effectiveness of measures taken by the CIS internal affairs bodies in combating them. It is important to examine the reasons that contribute to the spread of terrorist threats, assess the effectiveness of existing measures to combat terrorism, and identify their shortcomings.

2. Examination of mechanisms of coordination of work between the CIS internal affairs bodies and other law enforcement and special services in the field of terrorism prevention.

3. Analysis of international experience in the organisation of interaction between law enforcement and special services in the fight against terrorism. Analysis of the best practices of law enforcement and special services in the CIS countries. This concerns international conventions and treaties in the field of combating terrorism and their impact on the work of the CIS internal affairs bodies, the development of recommendations for adapting the international experience to the conditions of the CIS.

4. Analysis of the role of the public in the fight against terrorism and its interaction with the CIS internal affairs bodies, which implies the development of mechanisms for involving the public in the work of the CIS internal affairs bodies in the fight against terrorism.

5. Examination of the issues of legal regulation of the activities of the CIS internal affairs bodies. This is the most important and least examined task in other studies, which includes the following issues: analysis of the legislation of the CIS member states in the field of combating terrorism, the practice of applying legislation and evaluating its effectiveness, the development of mechanisms for monitoring compliance with legislation in the field of combating terrorism.

The comprehensive approach of the study will provide a more complete understanding of the mechanisms of combating the terrorist threat and the effectiveness of measures taken by the internal affairs bodies.

Materials and Methods

The methodological basis of this study contained an analytical method, a synthesis method, a formal logical method, system-structural, and statistical methods. The analytical method was used by the authors in the analysis of regulatory legal acts of the CIS countries, such as: Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan No. 687-IQ “On the fight against terrorism” [10], Law of the Republic of Armenia No. SP-79 “On combating terrorism” [11], Law of the Republic of Tajikistan No. 41 “On the police” [12], Criminal Code of the Kyrgyz Republic [13], and a comparative analysis of international documents on combating terrorism: programme of cooperation between the CIS member states in the fight against terrorism and

extremism for 2023-2025 [14], Programme of cooperation between the member states of the Commonwealth of Independent States in the fight against terrorism and other violent manifestations of extremism for 2020-2022 [15], Regulations on the Antiterrorist Centre of the Member States of the Commonwealth of Independent States [16]. In addition, a number of relevant provisions in the field of corruption were examined: Istanbul Anti-Corruption Action Plan [17], The concept of cooperation between the CIS member states in combatting corruption [18]. This method allowed for determining the legal aspects of the interaction of the CIS internal affairs bodies in the fight against terrorism, identifying shortcomings in existing legal acts, and proposing measures to improve them.

The synthesis method allowed for combining theoretical findings on the subject of publication and identifying the so-called gaps in the work of security structures guided by legislation, and identifying possible ways to promote terrorism. Within the framework of the system-structural method, the interrelationships between various elements of the system of combating terrorism are investigated and the causes of terrorism and its consequences are determined. This includes international and domestic politics, the work of law enforcement agencies, and the influence of society. Ultimately, the method helped to identify weaknesses in the system of combating terrorism and take measures to eliminate them. In addition, this method was used to evaluate the effectiveness of measures already taken and to develop new strategies to combat terrorism. The statistical method was used in the examination of indicators of terrorist acts in recent years (2022-2023). This helped to identify more vulnerable regions, and trends and patterns in the activities of the CIS internal affairs bodies and assess the effectiveness of their actions in the fight against terrorism. The method allowed identifying trends and patterns in the activities of terrorists.

A literature review was also conducted. The collected data was analysed using content analysis in combination with the principles of statutory legislation and prescriptive analysis. This allowed comparing the results obtained and determining the general state of the work of the internal affairs bodies in preventing terrorism in the CIS countries. In addition, works related to Asia, in general, were examined, which allowed comprehensively comparing the state of affairs in the fight against terrorism. The use of these methods in the study of the interaction of the CIS internal affairs bodies in the prevention of terrorism helped to identify problems in the work of the internal affairs bodies and identify areas for improving their cooperation. The combination of methods allowed getting a comprehensive understanding of the problem of combating terrorism in the CIS and developing recommendations for improving the situation in this area, which will allow fighting terrorism more effectively and ensuring the safety of CIS citizens.

Results

According to The Global Terrorism Index [1], the CIS countries are at the equator in the international ranking on the terrorism index. The situation in Central Asia is not as bad as in South Asia, Tajikistan is in 50th place, and Uzbekistan is in 70th, although the crime index worsened

in 2022, other CIS countries, according to data, are without much influence of terrorism. Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, and Turkmenistan remained in 93rd place. The CIS anti-terrorism legislation is based on international standards and norms, including national laws and regulations of each participant, resolutions of the UN General Assembly, and international treaties. The main purpose of the legislation of the Commonwealth of Independent States in countering terrorism is to prevent, detect, suppress and punish terrorist acts, and to ensure the protection of citizens' rights and freedoms. In this regard, on October 11, 2019, the decision of the Council of Leaders of the CIS states adopted the "programme of cooperation between the member states of the Commonwealth of Independent States in the fight against terrorism and other violent manifestations of extremism for 2020-2022" [15].

There are many causes of terrorism, but the following factors can be named among the main ones in the CIS countries. First of all, the arms trade. Terrorist organisations can obtain funds through the illegal trade in prohibited weapons, such as small arms, explosives and other military materials, which allows them to conduct their operations. Geopolitical interference has a direct connection. Terrorist activity may increase due to external interference, military actions, or geopolitical interests of other countries in regional conflicts, which contributes to the creation of a climate favourable for terrorist organisations. In this regard, responsibility is assigned to the internal affairs bodies of the CIS states. Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 906 "On approval of the categories of customs officials entitled to carry, store and use firearms, lists of special means and types of firearms and ammunition used by customs officials" [19] established a list of customs officials who are allowed to carry, store, and the use of firearms. A Regulatory Resolution of the Supreme Court of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 10 "On the practice of applying legislation on criminal liability for smuggling" [20] clarifies the meaning of smuggling and strengthens restrictive and control measures.

Effective ways to combat smuggling, for example, weapons, are the methods of the Republic of Tajikistan. And although the Constitution of the Republic of Tajikistan [21] does not contain special provisions relating to responsibility for arms smuggling, the constitutionally establishes the obligation of citizens to pay taxes on methods of combating illegal supplies of goods in free circulation. The legislation of the Republic of Tajikistan also provides for liability for the illegal production, acquisition, storage, transportation, and transfer of weapons and ammunition without appropriate permission or in violation of established rules and requirements. Responsibility for arms smuggling may include criminal punishment in the form of imprisonment, fines, and other measures in accordance with the current criminal legislation of the Republic of Tajikistan.

According to Article 289 of the Criminal Code of the Republic of Tajikistan [22], persons who import, export, transport, or otherwise move prohibited items, including weapons, ammunition, and explosives, across the customs border of the Republic of Tajikistan, without appropriate permission or in violation of the established procedure, are subject to criminal liability. Smuggling of radioactive,

explosive substances, weapons, explosive devices, firearms, ammunition or military equipment, nuclear, chemical, biological or other types of weapons of mass destruction, materials, and equipment that may be involved in the creation of weapons of mass destruction, is punishable for a term of 5 to 10 years of imprisonment with or without confiscation of property such.

It is rational that the internal affairs bodies of the CIS can use criminological data to analyse terrorist acts, identify common features in their commission, and determine the places of origin of terrorist groups, and their methods of financing. In addition, criminological research can help in determining the profiles of terrorists, which in turn can help in their identification and prevention of terrorist acts. The CIS internal affairs bodies can also use criminological data to analyse international terrorism, identify international terrorist networks and their ways of moving around the CIS countries. Criminology can be very useful for the internal affairs bodies of the CIS in the fight against terrorism. Therewith, it should be considered that criminological data is not the only tool for combating terrorism and should be used in combination with other methods and tools.

The country has a State programme for combating crime in the Republic of Tajikistan for 2021-2030 [19], according to which the programme is the main document for the organisation and implementation of measures to combat crime, including terrorism, on the territory of the Republic of Tajikistan during this period. The ministries, departments, and organisations of the Republic of Tajikistan should fully ensure the implementation of the measures provided for in the State Crime Prevention Programme for 2021-2030, in accordance with their competence and the functions assigned to them. Coordination and monitoring of the implementation of the State programme is conducted by the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Republic of Tajikistan. In addition, there is a need to provide in the annual budget plans of public authorities and local self-government the financing of activities provided for by the State programme. Law of the Republic of Tajikistan No. 41 “On the police” [12], and other countries, establishes the foundations of the police as an authority responsible for ensuring law and order, protecting the rights and freedoms of citizens, and combating crime on the territory of Tajikistan. The law defines the mechanisms of interaction between the police and other law enforcement agencies, such as the prosecutor’s office, the judicial system, customs, migration service, within the framework of their functions, which allows taking an integrated approach in the fight against crime.

Another of the main factors that contribute to terrorism in the CIS and in the world, in general, is corruption. This is one of the most common negative phenomena in state and local authorities in CIS countries. Corruption is defined as the abuse of an official position, bribery, abuse of power, bribery in the conclusion of business transactions, or other illegal use by a person of their official position to the detriment of the legitimate interests of society and the state. This includes obtaining illegal benefits in the form of money, valuables, goods, or services, acquiring other property rights for oneself or third

parties, and transferring such benefits to another person or citizen violating the law.

The link between corruption and terrorism can manifest itself in several aspects: corruption can be used by terrorist organisations as a source of financing for their activities; corruption can also facilitate the illegal trade in weapons and drugs that can be used by terrorist organisations to finance their activities; corruption in law enforcement agencies, such as the police, security services, can weaken their effectiveness in combating terrorist activities; corruption may be associated with violations of migration and border rules, which may facilitate the movement of terrorists across borders, including for the organisation of terrorist acts or for hiding from law enforcement agencies. The concept of cooperation between the CIS member states in combatting corruption [18] was adopted in the field of countering the legalisation of proceeds from crime, the financing of terrorism, and the proliferation of weapons of mass destruction to combat corruption in law enforcement agencies and other government structures. The document is designed for further systematic development of interaction and ensuring coordinated actions in these areas and is also aimed at developing the legal and organisational foundations of interaction.

On the example of Kyrgyzstan, the turnover of income from terrorism was examined. Notably, when determining the income and funds used in the commission of crimes, the Criminal Code of the Kyrgyz Republic [13] and the Criminal Procedure Code of the Kyrgyz Republic [23] provide different definitions. However, none of these Codes, and the draft “Law on Combating the Financing of Terrorism and Laundering of Proceeds of Crime”, contain provisions on the confiscation of assets into which proceeds of crime were converted – parts of the property that included proceeds of crime, profits, other benefits, and income from the criminal activity itself. In addition, Kyrgyz legislation does not allow the transfer of the obligation to prove the legality of the origin of potential proceeds of crime or other assets that can be confiscated [17].

It is important to note that in the CIS countries, especially in regions with a substantial Muslim population, the growth of extremist religious ideologies, especially Islamic extremism, can fuel terrorist activities. Thus, religious extremism and terrorism pose serious challenges for Kazakhstan, and for many other countries in the world. In Kazakhstan, various religious groups and communities coexist together, but there are also potential sources of religious extremism that can lead to terrorist acts. One of the reasons for religious extremism in Kazakhstan may be related to the processes of globalisation, migration, and changes in the socio-cultural dynamics of the country. The uncontrolled influx of foreign ideas, beliefs, and cultural practices can contribute to the spread of extremist ideas and religious doctrines, especially among young people. Organisations such as the Islamic State (IS), the Taliban, and other extremist groups may try to recruit and mobilise their supporters in Kazakhstan to conduct terrorist acts. Kazakhstan is actively taking measures to counter religious extremism and terrorism. This includes improving security measures, including legislative and operational measures, to prevent and suppress the activities of extremist organisations and groups. Kazakhstan is also working to

increase religious tolerance, conduct preventive work with young people, and improve socio-economic conditions to reduce the risks of the spread of religious extremism. However, solving the problem of religious extremism and terrorism requires a comprehensive approach that includes social, economic, cultural, and political aspects.

Political instability: The absence of a stable political system, political struggle, coup d'état, or a power vacuum can contribute to the creation of favourable conditions for terrorist organisations that will try to take advantage of the situation to achieve their goals. A good example is the joint work of the Republic of Kazakhstan and Uzbekistan. The media constantly portray these countries and their leaders as enemies. This is a cliché rooted in Soviet times. In fact, cooperation is being conducted to block and partially contain the problematic policies of Tajikistan and Kyrgyzstan to prevent the destabilisation of the entire region. It has been manifested more than once in the case of a coup in Kyrgyzstan and in the case of water and energy disputes.

As a clear example of the coordinated work of law enforcement agencies and state structures to control the order in the country, the internal bodies of Azerbaijan are notable, such as the Ministry of Internal Affairs (MIA), which implements a number of measures to combat terrorism in accordance with national legislation and international obligations of the country. Thus, the Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan No. 687-IQ "On the fight against terrorism" [10] was adopted. Its main goal is to prevent and counter terrorist actions on the territory of Azerbaijan. The Law explains terrorism as the use of violence, threats of violence, or the creation of danger to the life, health, or property of citizens, organisations, or the state with the aim of destabilising public and political order, causing panic in society, changing the constitutional order, or exerting pressure on state authorities. The government document provides for measures to prevent terrorist acts, including the creation of a security system, control of the movement of people and goods across state borders, and control of financial transactions related to the financing of terrorism. The Law also guarantees the protection of the rights and freedoms of citizens in the fight against terrorism. The Criminal Code of the Republic of Azerbaijan [24] establishes responsibility for the commission of terrorist acts, including the financing of terrorism, the creation of terrorist groups, the production and use of explosive devices, and other means of terrorism, and attempts to commit such acts. The Law also provides a framework for international cooperation in the fight against terrorism, including cooperation with other states, international organisations, and public authorities of other countries [25; 26].

In addition, the Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan No. 687-IQ "On the fight against terrorism" [10] dictates measures for the rehabilitation of persons who took part in terrorist activities, including rehabilitation programmes, psychological support, educational activities, and other measures aimed at preventing their relapse. Witness protection and cooperation with them also exist. As in other CIS countries, it provides for the possibility of confiscation of property related to terrorist activities or financing of terrorism, in accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Azerbaijan.

Not only the Republic of Azerbaijan but also other CIS countries, provide for legislation on combating terrorism, which establishes a set of measures aimed at preventing, detecting and countering terrorist activities on the territory of the state, protecting the rights and freedoms of citizens and measures for the rehabilitation and re-socialisation of persons who took part in terrorism. According to the legislation of Armenia [11], the fight against terrorism is conducted by state bodies authorised by the Government of the Republic of Armenia, within the powers granted by law. The entities directly involved in the fight against terrorism include: The Executive Body of the National Security of the Republic of Armenia; The Executive body of the Police of the Republic of Armenia; The Executive Body of the Republic for the defence of the Republic of Armenia. Other administrative bodies of the Republic of Armenia also take part in the fight against terrorism within their statutory powers. If necessary, the President of the State may create an operational headquarters for combating terrorism to coordinate the activities of organisations and other republican bodies directly involved in the fight against terrorism, to which the heads of state organisations are sent.

The fight against terrorism is one of the priorities of the CIS internal governance bodies at the interstate level [27-29]. In this area, the governments of the countries closely cooperate to prevent terrorist acts, identify, and suppress terrorist activities, investigate terrorist crimes, and bring terrorists to justice. However, their interaction needs to improve well-coordinated work. One of the most important institutions involved in the fight against terrorism within the CIS is the Council of Ministers of Internal Affairs of the CIS member states [30]. Its duties include coordinating the activities of the law enforcement agencies of the taking part States to prevent and counter terrorist activities, exchanging information on terrorist threats, and organising joint counter-terrorism and special operations [31-33]. In addition, based on the decision of the Council of the Head of the CIS member States on June 21, 2000, the CIS Antiterrorist Centre was formed and put into operation and the corresponding regulation was approved [16]. Its main tasks are the analysis and exchange of information on terrorist threats, planning and coordination of operations, conducting exercises and training, providing expert assistance and cooperation with other international organisations in the fight against terrorism. The CIS Antiterrorist Centre coordinates the work of state security agencies, special services, and law enforcement agencies in the fight against international terrorism [34].

The internal affairs bodies in the CIS countries are fighting terrorism through various measures and actions. One of the main measures is to improve the work of specialised units of internal bodies, such as departments for combating extremism, nationalism, and terrorism. These units collect information about potential terrorists, conduct operational measures to prevent terrorist acts and detain suspects of committing terrorist crimes. Another important measure is the cooperation of the internal affairs bodies of different countries in the fight against terrorism. A Security and Cooperation Service has been established within the CIS, which coordinates the activities of the internal affairs bodies of different countries in the field of combating terrorism. In addition, the internal affairs bodies conduct

preventive work with the population to prevent the involvement of young people in extremist activities and terrorism [35-37]. For this purpose, lectures, seminars, trainings, and other events are held, which are aimed at forming a positive attitude towards the state and the law among citizens. In addition, in some CIS countries there is a legislative framework that allows for a more stringent response to terrorist acts and to stop them at an early stage. Law enforcement agencies and other government agencies in the CIS countries are fighting terrorism using an integrated approach that includes various measures and actions. However, despite all efforts, terrorist acts still happen, so the fight against terrorism remains one of the main tasks of the internal affairs bodies in the CIS [38]. In modern conditions, there is a need to expand the system of preventive measures aimed at identifying the causes and circumstances that contribute to terrorism.

In general, the complex and well-coordinated activities of the internal bodies of the CIS countries can partially reduce, and further lead to the complete elimination of terrorism. As part of the fight against terrorism in the CIS, the leaders of the taking part countries approved the “programme of cooperation between the CIS member states in the fight against terrorism and extremism for 2023-2025” [14]. The programme is aimed at preventing threats of a terrorist and extremist nature and is based on a number of Treaties and Concepts of cooperation between the CIS member states in the fight against terrorism and other ways that can contribute to crime in any way.

By joint efforts, law enforcement agencies of different countries can cooperate with each other in various fields, such as combating crime, terrorism, smuggling, and other illegal activities [39; 40]. Cooperation between law enforcement agencies of the countries is effectively conducted through international agreements and arrangements. Thus, the law enforcement agencies of countries can exchange information about crimes, suspects, methods of committing crimes, the instruments of crime used, and other information that can help in the investigation of crimes. Joint operational activities are also possible. Law enforcement agencies can jointly conduct searches, detentions and other operations that can help in the investigation of crimes and the detention of criminals. In some cases, law enforcement agencies of countries can jointly create operational groups that investigate complex and major crimes [41]. In addition, the law enforcement agencies of the countries can jointly conduct various trainings, seminars, and training programmes to improve the skills of employees, and the exchange of experience and the transfer of best practices in the fight against crime. Due to the fact that an integrated approach to combating terrorism is more effective in international cooperation, assistance to law enforcement agencies of different countries is very important for combating crime and ensuring the safety of citizens.

Discussion

The issue of preventing and combating terrorism does not lose its importance in the work of researchers from all over the world. As stated in the study by R. Bossong and L. Holmes [4], countries differ greatly in their fight against terrorism and organised crime due to substantial cultural differences in issues of human rights, democracy, and

sovereignty, with which the authors of this study agree. But there are similar points in national legislation, especially when it comes to international politics. Researchers have established similarities in the fight against terrorism with EU member states, while their relationships are considered complex. C. Pierobon [25] also drew attention to the EU’s assistance in the fight against terrorism and extremism. According to this concept, on the contrary, cooperation with the European Union through the involvement of civil society organisations is effective. Although the researchers of both studies insist on the commonwealth of countries, it is important to note that their regulatory framework and practical methods of regulating the fight against terrorism are not valid since political misunderstandings come to the fore here.

The same opinion about the Commonwealth of States fighting terrorism is shared by A. Ashar and C. Maharani [6] and also C. Lanouar and U. Shahzad [26]. They believe that transnational organised crime and terrorism in Asian regions are closely linked. Financial intelligence units play a substantial role in the fight against organised crime and terrorism, including their ability to collect and analyse financial data to identify and suppress illegal financial flows. The authors insist on the importance of international cooperation in the fight against organised crime and terrorism, including the exchange of operational information and best practices between the countries of the region and with external partners. While sanctions can be effective in curbing illegal financial flows, they can also have unintended consequences, for example, contribute to further concealment of illegal activities [42; 43]. That is why there is a need for an integrated and coordinated approach to combating organised crime and terrorism. This includes strengthening the legal and institutional framework, strengthening international cooperation and curbing illicit financial flows through tools such as financial intelligence agencies and targeted sanctions.

N. Shukuralieva and A. Lipiński [27] cite examples of cooperation between international criminal and terrorist groups. The tactics and strategies used by organised criminal groups and terrorist organisations also partially coincide, but there are also substantial differences. However, organised criminal groups are primarily motivated by profit and economic gain, while terrorism is rather guided by political goals [44-46]. The researchers also give examples of interpretation of various ideas about Islam as a threat in the regions of Asia and focus more on the consideration of the securitisation of Islam in Central Asia in the military, political, and public sectors. The article focuses more on the threats of extremism emanating from religious differences, in contrast to this study. In turn, D. Sharipova and S. Beissembayev [28], assessing extremist violence specifically in Kazakhstan, believe that it is provoked by criminal youth subculture, insults, Salafi-jihadist ideology, and propaganda on the Internet. A brief comparative analysis of European jihadists and militant extremists in Kazakhstan identified some important similarities and differences between the regions. D. Gamza and P. Jones [29] have compiled a more complete and dynamic report on the legal framework that underlies religious regulation in Central Asia since independence. The main focus will be on Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, and Uzbekistan. Although the state structures of these countries

were more restricted religious beliefs and practices that go beyond the approved interpretations of Islam, a turn towards criminalisation still happened [47; 48]. Unlike other approaches, which usually focus on several key laws, high-profile events, or secondary sources, their study included an analysis of all legal documents that are available in state digital legal data repositories.

A.V. Reshetnyak [30] names cultural aspects among the factors of terrorism and extremism. He also considers inequality, poverty, marginalisation, political discrimination, religious, and ideological radicalisation, violation of human rights, conflicts, geopolitical tensions as the main reasons. According to a study by T. Kohno [31], the Asian region is concerned about the influx of foreign terrorists and the continued growth of religious extremism. Like previous researchers, the author emphasises the importance of intercultural dialogue, respect for human rights, social justice, and sustainable development in preventing terrorism and creating peace and stability in society. Thus, these studies, as well as this one, were aimed at assessing extremist and terrorist risks in Asian regions and cite these threats as the main ones among crimes threatening the security of countries. According to R. Gunaratna [8], some parts of Asia recognise the importance of recovery, but not all countries affected by terrorism have succeeded in building recovery capacity. The author believes that the rehabilitation of terrorists can reduce the number of crimes. However, it is worth emphasising that the importance of this issue rather exists in the early stages, when the crime can be prevented. This aspect has not been considered in this study, but the authors agree with the opinion of the aforementioned author.

Thus, according to F. Carril-Caccia et al. [32], there are two main mechanisms in world practice: political and legal. Political mechanisms include the active involvement of relevant state bodies. In the legal mechanism, courts play an important role in identifying organisations as terrorists. Perhaps legal mechanisms are preferable to identifying organisations and groups as terrorists [49]. Additionally, the observance of the law, justice, impartiality, and respect for the fundamental rights and freedoms of the individual are guaranteed. In contrast to the results obtained as a result of the study regarding corruption, extremism, smuggling, and political instability, D. Hou [3] considers a narrower range of causes of domestic terrorism in Asia: the type of regime, ethnic, linguistic, religious components, while according to K. Mukherjee [33], in addition to the factors of terrorism examined in this study, there are others: conflicts between ethnic groups and religions. According to him, the CIS region has a complex ethnic and religious demography, and the presence of such conflicts can provoke terrorist acts aimed at promoting a certain political or religious agenda. Race, ethnicity, and religion intersect and interact with other factors such as nationalism, identity politics, socio-economic inequality, and geopolitical dynamics to influence the origins, dynamics, and consequences of conflicts in Asia [50-52].

W. Chinnakum [34] states that the standard of living, substantial unemployment and lack of opportunities for development can lead to social and economic inequality, which terrorist organisations can use to stimulate public

support. These studies show the contribution of such control variables as economic growth to reducing income inequality and openness to trade, to improving the standard of living of poor households, despite their tendency to covariate with income inequality. Thus, the relationship between financial accessibility and income inequality is solvable, but the article focuses more on collecting and analysing statistical data than on predicting results or creating exit concepts. As mentioned earlier, one of the leading obstacles in the fight against terrorism is smuggling. According to D. Kim and Y. Tajima [35], terrorist groups can earn substantial income from smuggling, including the transportation and sale of drugs, weapons, jewellery, and other illegal goods. Globalisation, economic growth, patterns of armed conflict, and government and civil society responses have contributed to the rapid growth in the size and scope of illicit markets for goods and services [53-55].

Notably, in continuation of the issue of smuggling, the implementation of rather complex schemes for the sale of weapons and explosive substances, which often become instruments of crime, would not have had such a scale without its financing. Thus, H. Gowhor [5] uses the meaning of “terrorist groups” and claims that they, like any other organisation, need funding for their activities, such as acquiring weapons, training militants, hiring mercenaries. Tracking cash flows today plays an important role in the fight against terrorism. Financial intelligence units are being created that study the financing of terrorism, money laundering, and tax evasion to investigate suspicious transactions. It is impossible not to agree that monitoring and measuring progress is an important part of efforts to curb financial activities in the fight against terrorism. According to N. Sultan et al. [7], the fight against terror has led to increased attention to law enforcement and anti-terrorist measures in the regions, which, in turn, has led to the criminalisation of certain types of economic activities and the growth of the informal economy. Therefore, there is an impact of this trend on the political and economic development of the region, and on civil society and human rights. Despite the existence of laws and regulations aimed at combating money laundering and terrorist financing, the implementation of these measures has been weak and ineffective in some regions of Asia [56; 57]. Therefore, the success of efforts to combat these problems depends on political will and the lack of such will hinder the achievement of the desired results.

There is another concept of development in the context of national security, and the consequences of this relationship for civil society, proposed by S. Prakasa et al. [36]. The conventional development focus on economic growth and poverty reduction should be expanded to include national security issues such as countering terrorism and conflict prevention. This shift in emphasis has led to the militarisation of development, which can have negative consequences for civil society, including reduced involvement and the possibility of human rights violations. In continuation of the subject of crimes against humanity, S. Lupi [37] claims that such acts are often associated with violent markets, which include the production and trade of weapons, drugs, and other prohibited goods, fuelling conflicts around the world. Because there are problems of investigation and

prosecution of international crimes, including issues related to jurisdiction, evidence, and witness protection. Therefore, it is important to pay attention to criminal law in responding to these challenges, including the need to strengthen the international legal framework and expand cooperation between countries.

In contrast to the international legal acts described in this study, in study C. Sun et al. [38] consider the United Nations as a guarantor of resolving socio-economic inconsistencies and effective strategies for resolving regional conflicts to make this region peaceful and prosperous. Such an approach has the right to work effectively only in conjunction with international treaties within the CIS since the UN is more focused on the interests of the West. However, despite all efforts, the problem of terrorism remains relevant and still unresolved in the CIS. Some terrorist groups continue their activities aimed at destabilising the region and violating international security [58]. Evidently, the fight against terrorism in the CIS requires constant improvement and adaptation to the changing situation. It is important to maintain a balance between strengthening state security and protecting civil liberties and rights. Only in this case, it is possible to achieve sustainable results in the fight against terrorism in the CIS.

Conclusions

According to the results of the study, the internal affairs bodies in the CIS member states operate based on normative legal acts regulating the fight against terrorism, and based on international treaties and agreements. The analysis of these documents allowed identifying the main problems and challenges in the fight against terrorism in the CIS. In addition, through statistical data, the most vulnerable regions to terrorism were identified. The main causes were monitored, and the compliance of the actions of law enforcement agencies regarding these factors. As a

result, recommendations were formed on improving the legal, political, religious, and social fields to prevent terrorist acts and other threats to public security.

The existing knowledge was systematised and adjustments and prospects for their further studies were made. The work of the state security structures of the CIS countries was evaluated. In general, the study identified some problems and challenges in the field of combating terrorism in the CIS, such as insufficient coordination between internal affairs bodies, insufficient training of specialists, and lack of modern technical means to combat the terrorist threat. However, the study also allowed the development of some recommendations for strengthening the fight against terrorism in the CIS, including improving interdepartmental cooperation, improving the skills of specialists, and providing access to new technical means.

Thus, this study may be of interest to future researchers in regulatory-related fields and raise many questions and concerns that should be considered in the future. It is worth reviewing and updating the legal regulation and responsibility for the crime. The results obtained will form the basis for further comparative analyses of the data and current problems. In addition, the results of the study may be useful for other countries and international organisations that also face the threat of terrorism and need to improve cooperation in this area. It is important to examine which specific measures have led to improved interaction between the CIS internal affairs bodies and which measures have been most effective in the fight against terrorism.

Acknowledgements

None.

Conflict of Interest

None.

References

- [1] The Global Terrorism Index. 2023. <https://www.economicsandpeace.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/03/GTI-2023-web.pdf>.
- [2] Kuznar LA, Day J. Hunting for Gray rhinos and terrorism in the Middle East, North Africa, and Central Asia. *Dynam Asym Conf*. 2022;15(2):141-152.
- [3] Hou D. The impact of education on domestic terrorism in Asia: A control function approach. *Defen Peace Econ*. 2022;33(7):857-875.
- [4] Bossong R, Holmes L. Organised crime and terrorism. In: *The European Union's Security Relations with Asian Partners* (pp. 115-137). Cham: Palgrave Macmillan; 2021.
- [5] Gowhor HS. The preferred type of financial intelligence for early detection of terrorist financing activities. *J Money Laund Contr*. 2022;25(3):681-690.
- [6] Ashar AR, Maharani C. Far from home: Profile of pro-IS deportees' mobility throughout 2016-2020 and prevention strategy of Indonesian government. *J ASEAN Stud*. 2022;10(1):81-105.
- [7] Sultan N, Mohamed N, Bashir MA, Bashir MF. The anti-money laundering and counter financing of terrorism policy in Pakistan: Is it truly combating or just a high-level desk work bureaucracy? *J Pub Affair*. 2022;22(4):e2731.
- [8] Gunaratna R. Counter-terrorism in Asia: The state partnership with civil society organizations. In: *Civil Society Organizations Against Terrorism: Case Studies from Asia* (pp. 14-62). Abingdon: Routledge; 2021.
- [9] Shin H, Hertelendy AJ, Hart A, Tin D, Issa F, Hata R, Ciottone GR. Terrorism-related attacks in East Asia from 1970 through 2020. *Prehosp Disas Med*. 2023;38(2):232-236.
- [10] Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan No. 687-IQ "On the fight against terrorism". 1999. https://base.spinform.ru/show_doc.fwx?rgn=2775.
- [11] Law of the Republic of Armenia No. 3P-79 "On combating terrorism". 2005. https://base.spinform.ru/show_doc.fwx?rgn=26063

- [12] Law of the Republic of Tajikistan No. 41 “On the police”. 2004. http://ncz.tj/system/files/Legislation/41_ru_0.pdf.
- [13] Criminal Code of the Kyrgyz Republic. 2021. <http://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/act/view/ru-ru/112309>.
- [14] Program of cooperation between the CIS member states in the fight against terrorism and extremism for 2023-2025. 2022. <https://cisatc.org/109777897.pdf>.
- [15] Program of cooperation between the member states of the Commonwealth of Independent States in the fight against terrorism and other violent manifestations of extremism for 2020-2022. 2019. <https://www.cisatc.org/1291/1334>.
- [16] Regulations on the Antiterrorist Center of the Member States of the Commonwealth of Independent States. 2018. <https://www.cisatc.org/189>.
- [17] Istanbul Anti-Corruption Action Plan for Armenia, Azerbaijan, Georgia, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyz Republic, Russian Federation, Tajikistan and Ukraine. Monitoring report; 2004. <https://www.oecd.org/investment/anti-bribery/34303235.pdf>.
- [18] The concept of cooperation between the CIS member states in combating corruption. 2017. <https://cis.minsk.by/page/19285>.
- [19] Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 906 “On approval of the categories of customs officials entitled to carry, store and use firearms, lists of special means and types of firearms and ammunition used by customs officials”. 2010. <https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/P100001014>.
- [20] Regulatory Resolution of the Supreme Court of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 10 “On the practice of applying legislation on criminal liability for smuggling”. 1997. <https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/P97000010S>.
- [21] Constitution of the Republic of Tajikistan. 1994. <https://prokuratura.tj/ru/legislation/the-constitution-of-the-republic-of-tajikistan.html>.
- [22] Criminal Code of the Republic of Tajikistan. 1998. <https://faolex.fao.org/docs/pdf/taj197648.pdf>.
- [23] Criminal Procedure Code of the Kyrgyz Republic. 2021. <http://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/act/view/ru-ru/112308>.
- [24] Criminal Code of the Republic of Azerbaijan. 1999. https://continent-online.com/Document/?doc_id=30420353.
- [25] Pierobon C. EU efforts to prevent violent extremism (PVE) by engaging civil society in Kyrgyzstan. *Centr Asia Affair*. 2021;8(2):150-174.
- [26] Lanouar C, Shahzad U. Terrorism and capital flows: The missed impact of terrorism in big cities. *Appl Econ Letter*. 2021;28(18):1626-1633.
- [27] Shukuralieva N, Lipiński A. Islamic extremism and terrorism in Central Asia: A critical analysis. *Centr Asia Caucas*. 2021;24(1):120-132.
- [28] Sharipova D, Beissembayev S. Causes of violent extremism in central Asia: The case of Kazakhstan. *Studies in Conflict and Terrorism*. 2021. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1057610X.2021.1872163>.
- [29] Gamza D, Jones P. The evolution of religious regulation in Central Asia, 1991-2018. *Centr Asia Surv*. 2021;40(2):197-221.
- [30] Reshetnyak AV. *Terrorism and religious extremism in Central Asia: Problems of perception. Case of Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan*. Astana: KazISS under the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan; 2016.
- [31] Kohno T. To combat extremism, how to frame religion matters: Southeast Asia in comparative perspective. *Stud Islam*. 2021;28(3):483-515.
- [32] Carril-Caccia F, Paniagua J, Requena F. Asylum migration, borders, and terrorism in a structural gravity model. *Polit Gover*. 2021;9(4):146-158.
- [33] Mukherjee K. *Race, ethnicity and religion in conflict across Asia*. London: Routledge; 2021.
- [34] Chinnakum W. Impacts of financial inclusion on poverty and income inequality in developing Asia. *Singapore Economic Review*. 2021. <https://doi.org/10.1142/S0217590822440027>.
- [35] Kim D, Tajima Y. Smuggling and border enforcement. *Int Org*. 2022;76(4):830-867.
- [36] Prakasa SUW, Al-Fatih S, Haqqi ARA. Terrorism eradication in ASEAN countries: Human rights perspective. *Al-Ihkam: J Huk Dan Pranat Sosial*. 2021;16(2):327-361.
- [37] Lupi S. Is the time right to make ‘provision of weapons’ an international crime? *Cambridge Int Law J*. 2022;11(1):75-95.
- [38] Sun C, Abbas HSM, Xu X, Abbas S. The impact of socio-economic and fractionalization determinants on terrorism in ESNA. *Socio-Econ Plan Sci*. 2022;79:101138.
- [39] Kotlyar Y. Decommunization of Ukraine in the context of generation change. *Danub*. 2017;2017(35):99-108.
- [40] Loxha A. Do remittances reduce poverty in Kosovo? - A counterfactual analysis. *South East Eur J Econ Busin*. 2019;14(2):117-132.
- [41] Ilderbayev O, Zharmakhanova G, Rakhyzhanova S, Musaynova A, Ilderbayeva G, Nursafina A, Zhazykbayeva L. Immune System Response after Immobilization Stress in the Background of Ionizing Radiation. *Trends Sci*. 2022;19(13):4637.
- [42] Ainagulova G, Bulgakova O, Ilderbayev O, Manekenova K, Tatayeva R, Bersimbaev R. Molecular and immunological changes in blood of rats exposed to various doses of asbestos dust. *Cytok*. 2022;159:156016.
- [43] Dzhansarayeva RY, Dilbarkhanova ZR, Malikova SB, Atakhanova GM, Daubassova SS. Countermeasures to bioterrorism acts. *Biosci Biotechn Res Asia*. 2015;12(2):1849-1856.
- [44] Kukhtyn M, Salata V, Berhilevych O, Malimon Z, Tsvihun A, Gutyj B, Horiuk Y. Evaluation of storage methods of beef by microbiological and chemical indicators. *Potravin Slovak J Food Sci*. 2020;14:602-611.

- [45] Musiy L, Tsisaryk O, Slyvka I, Mykhaylytska O, Gutyj B. Research into probiotic properties of cultured butter during storing. *East-Eur J Enterp Technol.* 2017;3(11-87):31-36.
- [46] Sandul GO, Sandul OG, Bulgakov AO. On the nuclear decision-making theory. *Nuclear Radiat Safety.* 2018;4(80):58-64.
- [47] Tapbergenov SO, Zhetpisbaev BA, Ilderbayev OZ, Zhetpisbaeva HS, Olzhayeva RR, Prozor II, Usenova OA, Ilderbayeva GO. Free radical oxidation in rats in the delayed period after combined exposure to dust and radiation. *Bull Experim Biol Med.* 2013;154(6):747-749.
- [48] Chulenbayeva L, Ilderbayev O, Suleymeneva D, Kaliyeva A, Kabdykanov S, Nurgaziyev M, Nurgozhina A, Sergazy S, Kozhakhmetov S, Kushugulova A. Prolonged Inhalation Exposure to Coal Dust on Irradiated Rats and Consequences. *Sci World J.* 2022;2022:8824275.
- [49] Kashanski SV, Zhetpisbaev BA, Il'derbaev OZ, Ermenbaï OT. Mesothelioma in the Republic of Kazakhstan: a review. *Gig Sanit.* 2008;5:13-17.
- [50] Sagalevich AI, Voizianov SA, Juran BV, Kogut VV, Gaysenyuk FZ, Sergiychuk RV. Peculiarities of transcuteaneous nephrolithotripsy in the patient's position lying on the back. *Klinich Khirurgh.* 2016;8:49-52.
- [51] Rima D, Malikova S, Aratuly K, Bazilova A, Beaver KM. Examining the Association between Stuttering and Psychopathic Personality Traits, Nonviolent Crime, and Violent Crime. *J Aggress, Maltreatm Trauma.* 2021;30(2):193-206.
- [52] Akylbayeva IM, Malgarayeva ZB, Kussainova ZD, Amanzholuly SK, Umirzakova LA, Kalenova TS, Zharkenova AM, Tlebaldiyeva MD. Resources of terrorism spread and its globalization. *Life Sci J.* 2014;11(SPEC.ISS.1):202-206.
- [53] Maraj A, Jakupi G, Rogova E, Grajqevci X. Testing of network security systems through DoS attacks. In: 2017 6th Mediterranean Conference on Embedded Computing, MECO 2017 - Including ECYPS 2017, Proceedings (article number 7977239). Bar: Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers; 2017.
- [54] Maraj D, Maraj A, Hajzeraj A. Application interface for gesture recognition with Kinect sensor. In: 2016 IEEE International Conference on Knowledge Engineering and Applications, ICKEA 2016 (pp. 98-102). Singapore: Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers; 2016.
- [55] Kotlyar Y, Lyman M. Ukrainian shield in defense of European civilization: chronology and periodization. *Eminak.* 2023;3(43):255-271.
- [56] Kotlyar Y, Lyman M, Tykhonenko I. Pakistan-Ukraine. Analogies in the Triangles of Regional Security Complexes. *Annali Foscari Ser Orient.* 2020;56:219-244.
- [57] Bazilova AA, Malikova SB, Omarova AB, Atakhanova GM, Daubassov SS. Disadvantages in differentiation and exceeding limits of necessary defense according to the legislation of the republic of kazakhstan. *J Adv Res Law Econ.* 2016;7(4):752-758.
- [58] Rima D, Sholpan M, Gulzagira A, Meruert B, Beaver KM. Exploring the potential association between gang membership and health outcomes in a longitudinal sample of youth and young adults. *J Crim Justice.* 2020;66:101629.

Взаємодія органів внутрішніх справ держав-учасниць СНД у запобіганні тероризму

Ганібек Отарбаєв

Кизилординський університет імені Коркит Ата
120014, вул. Айтеке бі, 29А, м. Кизилорда, Республіка Казахстан

Ляззат Каржаубаєва

Кизилординський університет імені Коркит Ата
120014, вул. Айтеке бі, 29А, м. Кизилорда, Республіка Казахстан

Олена Мілова

Кизилординський університет імені Коркит Ата
120014, вул. Айтеке бі, 29А, м. Кизилорда, Республіка Казахстан

Лаура Отарбаєва

Департамент поліції міста Астана
010000, вул. Бейбітшілік, 19, м. Астана, Республіка Казахстан

Жулдизай Отарбаєва

Департамент освіти Кизилординської області
120002, вул. Султана Бейбарса, 1, м. Кизилорда, Республіка Казахстан

Анотація

Актуальність. Тероризм становить серйозну загрозу безпеці та стабільності не тільки окремих держав, а й усього міжнародного співтовариства, оскільки до 2023 року він набув транснаціонального характеру і є загрозою не тільки внутрішній безпеці країни, а й зовнішній. Для боротьби з тероризмом необхідна співпраця органів внутрішніх справ країн СНД та розробка ефективних методів запобігання терористичним актам.

Мета. Метою даного дослідження є вивчення взаємодії органів внутрішніх справ країн СНД у запобіганні тероризму та визначення ефективних методів боротьби з терористичною загрозою.

Методологія. У ході дослідження були використані наступні методи: аналітичний, синтетичний, статистичний.

Результати. Проведено аналіз нормативно-правових актів та міжнародних договорів, а також здійснено порівняння способів боротьби з тероризмом у державах-учасницях СНД. Дослідження показало, що ефективність боротьби з тероризмом в СНД залежить від якості взаємодії органів внутрішніх справ, їх технічного оснащення та професійної підготовки. Крім того, дослідження показало, що взаємодія правоохоронних органів різних країн є більш ефективною, ніж боротьба з криміногенними факторами в межах однієї держави.

Висновки. Міжнародна об'єднана боротьба може перекрити шляхи постачання та фінансової підтримки тероризму. Таким чином, проведені дослідження свідчать про схожість міжнародно-правових актів і законодавства СНД та їх недосконалість, що дозволяє здійснювати терористичні акти.

Ключові слова: боротьба зі злочинністю; антитерористичне законодавство; співучасть; кримінальна відповідальність; правоохоронні органи; міжнародна політика.